



**APPROVED  
SUMMARIZED MINUTES**

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE  
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
REGULAR MEETING**

**Thursday, December 19, 2019**

**KIVA – CITY HALL  
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD  
SCOTTSDALE, AZ 85251**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 5:15 p.m.

**2. ROLL CALL**

**PRESENT:** Barry Graham, Chair  
Pamela Iacovo, Vice Chair  
Don Anderson  
Mary Ann Miller

**ABSENT:** George Ertel  
Michael Kuzel  
B. Kent Lall

**STAFF:** Dan Worth, Executive Director, Public Works  
Ratna Koropella, Principal Transit Planner

**GUESTS:** Joseph Gross  
Yue Michelle Zhang  
Omar Peters, Valley Metro

**3. PUBLIC COMMENT**

Yue Michelle Zhang, Scottsdale resident of ten years, stated that it has been a difficult year to live in the City, due to the abundance of projects in southern Scottsdale with its high traffic volumes. She cited to projects on Thomas and Hayden, McDowell and Hayden, Scottsdale and Osborn, Miller and Indian School. At times it can take ten to 20 minutes just to travel out of the block she lives on. It is particularly difficult for small businesses to operate in such an

environment. Ranch Market at Thomas and Hayden went out of business last month as a direct result of the year-long construction in the area. The City should consider a construction mitigation fund for businesses harmed during the process. She also discussed a personal experience receiving a fine for a no right turn sign on Osborn and Scottsdale Road. She stated this sign violates multiple local and national codes. Chair thanked Ms. Zhang for her comments.

Joseph Gross spoke as a representative of Vi at Silverstone to request that Transportation staff study the impacts of increasing public transportation north on Scottsdale Road from its current termination at Thompson Peak Parkway two miles north to Pinnacle Peak Road and Scottsdale Road. Residents live on the site of the former Rawhide quarter section. There are four condominium developments in the same section. There are also two large shopping centers on Pinnacle Peak Road at Scottsdale Road. Silverstone has difficulty maintaining its staff of 200, due to the distance workers must travel to get to work. The conditions noted should justify extending service to the area, given that there is sufficient notification to residents and workers. Chair thanked Mr. Gross for his comments.

#### **4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – November 21, 2019

Chair invited comments on the minutes. Commissioner provided one grammatical correction.

COMMISSIONER MILLER MOVED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF THE TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION ON NOVEMBER 21, 2019 AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER ANDERSON SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 4-0 WITH CHAIR GRAHAM, VICE CHAIR IACOVO AND COMMISSIONERS ANDERSON AND MILLER VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

#### **5. APPROVAL OF 2020 TRANSPORTATION HEARING CALENDAR**

There were no changes or modifications to the proposed calendar.

COMMISSIONER ANDERSON MOVED TO APPROVE THE 2020 TRANSPORTATION HEARING CALENDAR AS PRESENTED. COMMISSIONER MILLER SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED 4-0 WITH CHAIR GRAHAM, VICE CHAIR IACOVO AND COMMISSIONERS ANDERSON AND MILLER VOTING IN THE AFFIRMATIVE WITH NO DISSENTING VOTES.

#### **6. NEW BUS AND TROLLEY ROUTE INITIAL EFFECTS**

Ratna Koropella, Principal Transit Planner, provided an update on the initial effects of bus and trolley route changes effective October 22, 2019. There are three service providers in the City: Valley Metro, City of Phoenix and RTW. Route 72, Scottsdale Road, currently runs from Thompson Peak to Fashion Square Mall, now at a 20-minute frequency. Route 81, Hayden Road, had relatively low ridership. The route was retained, but replaced with a trolley. Route 80, Shea Boulevard used to have a.m. and p.m. trips during rush hours to connect people to Mayo Clinic. Ridership was very low so a portion of the route was replaced with trolley service. Route 56, Priest Drive, was Valley Metro operated and ran to Desert Botanical Gardens. Ridership was so low that continued service could not be justified and the route was canceled.

For trolley service, there is a new Mustang route, replacing the segments that were deleted from Routes 80 and 81. Hours of service were adjusted to be more consistent at 20-minute frequency, 16 hours during weekdays and 14 hours during weekends. Minor modifications were made to routing in Downtown.

One year prior to the route modifications, the City was spending \$3.6 million for trolley service. As of October, 2019, the total was \$5.6 million. The \$2 million difference is derived from reductions from fixed route and expanded service. The change was made without additional cost. They moved funds around to make the system more efficient and provide more service. The expenses include all operating costs, costs paid to the contractor, fleet maintenance and repairs as well as fuel costs. Approximately \$650,000 in lottery funds and \$150,000 in maintenance grant fund offsets the costs.

Customer feedback indicated that some people wanted previous routes back. Some requested earlier start times. Some respondents requested that Mustang Trolley extend to the library and aquatic center.

Commissioner noted the significant decrease in ridership on the Old Town Trolley, despite only modest modifications. She asked what changes were made. Ms. Koropella said the route previously entered Fashion Square Mall at Marshall Way. They no longer do so. There is now a bit of a walk to enter the Mall. The route formerly served the Fifth Avenue shopping area and no longer does so. It was taking a significant amount of time for the trolleys to enter and exit Fifth Avenue during rush hour. Until a new survey is conducted, they cannot confirm the reasons for change in ridership.

Commissioner asked if the \$2 million increase in trolley cost is due to the extended route to 90th Street and whether money is being saved in another area to compensate for the increase. Ms. Koropella stated that \$2 million savings were realized from reductions where fixed route services were discontinued and the service moved to trolleys. Aside from the changes to Mustang Route, they also provided consistent 20-minute frequency. In the past, trolley frequency ranged from 20 to 60 minutes. Riders no longer need to memorize schedules. They have also expanded hours of service. Some costs had to be negotiated, as the City has a brand-new route with a different contractor. In six months, the City will issue an RFP to renegotiate costs. Ms. Koropella confirmed that the changes and costs were planned for. This included analysis of funding available for fixed routes and trolleys and working with Phoenix and Valley Metro regarding what funding could be swapped.

Vice Chair referenced the addition of the Cactus Route Trolley (Frank Lloyd Wright). Ms. Koropella clarified that the route was formally called the Cactus Route but has been renamed the Mustang Route. Vice Chair asked about ridership. Ms. Koropella stated that weekday riders total approximately 90,000. For Saturdays and Sundays, the ridership is relatively low. Vice Chair inquired as to the expenditure breakdown of fleet operations, maintenance and fuel. Ms. Koropella stated that she did not have this analysis readily available, but would be able to present this at an upcoming meeting.

Chair said he would be interested in seeing cost per rider analysis over time, as this is a key measurement of success. Ms. Koropella commented that routes typically take two to three years to build ridership. Uses are generally trending in a positive direction currently. One difficult aspect of calculating cost per ride is that the fuel, maintenance and repair costs are not typically calculated separately by bus. Operating expenses paid to the contractor can be calculated per boarding. Chair commented that fuel should be fairly simple, as an average cost

per mile times miles of the route times route frequency. Dan Worth, Executive Director, Public Works, acknowledged that the Department needs to do a better job of measuring performance against a metric. Currently, it would be a challenge to identify performance goals, however several metrics would be valuable for analysis. Commissioner commented that other information would also be helpful in terms of who is riding and whether ridership represents a population that the City is willing to spend more money to serve. Vice Chair commented that the data will also help decide where service should be added.

Omar Peters, Valley Metro, provided a presentation on the recently conducted regional onboard survey, which includes approximately 21,000 surveys collected between February through April of 2019. In the City of Scottsdale, 1,400 surveys (or approximately 10 percent of boarding) were conducted. In total, there are approximately 5,500 daily trips per day. Linked trips are only counted once.

Transit riders lean more male than female at a 60/40 split, similar to what is seen regionally. Chair asked about the reasons for the discrepancy. Mr. Peters stated that he was unable to explain this. This particular data point goes against national statistics, which typically lean female. He agreed with Chair's comment that perhaps when the ratio of men is quite high, women feel less welcome or at less at ease. In the last several years, safety and security has been seen as a key factor in ridership.

Mr. Omar stated that two peak ridership age groups are 25 to 34 and 35 to 44. This statistic has been seen regionally over the past few years. This demographic typically represents those in the workforce. For Scottsdale ridership, 58 percent are white, 19 percent Hispanic and 17 percent Black (although 2 percent of the Scottsdale population as a whole is Black.)

Forty-one percent of the Scottsdale population earn over \$100,000 per year, whereas only 3 percent of the ridership are from these households. Transit riders are typically from minority and low-income households. Forty-nine percent have no vehicle, however 24 percent indicate that they could have used a vehicle for their trip. Fifty-one percent of regional riders come from zero-car households and 18 percent indicate they had a car they could have used for the trip.

In the category of employment, 65 percent of Scottsdale riders are employed full-time, 14 percent part-time, 13 percent not employed and 8 percent retired. These statistics are very similar to the regional totals, however Scottsdale has a higher retired percentage, with the regional total being 5 percent. Eleven percent of riders are full- or part-time university students, similar to the region as a whole (12 percent). Other Scottsdale ridership details: 12 percent veterans (higher than the regional total of 6 percent); 2 percent visitors and 7 percent persons with disabilities.

Top routes traveled in Scottsdale include 68 CM – 68th Street/Camelback Trolley (15 percent), Miller/Hayden Trolley (12 percent), 81 Hayden/McClintock (11 percent), 72 Scottsdale Road/Rural (10 percent), 29 Thomas Road (7 percent) and Valley Metro Rail (6 percent). The survey results between 2015 and 2019 showed very little change in the percentage of riders on local routes. The biggest change is on the 81. In 2015, the ridership was 24 percent, which increased to 38 percent. Eighty percent of rides did not require a transfer, compared with the regional total of 55 percent. Fifty-one percent of Scottsdale riders use transit to get back and forth to work, 20 percent for other destinations (errands, going out to eat and personal business), 11 percent for non-home based purposes, 8 percent for shopping, 6 percent for college, 3 percent for medical and 1 percent for school.

For the mode of travel to reach bus stops or stations, 88 percent walk, 5 percent bike, 5 percent drive or are dropped off and 2 percent use other modes, such as scooter, bike share, Uber or Lyft. In obtaining schedule information, 67 percent of riders use an online tool. For fare type, most people utilize a 1-ride ride pass (24 percent), followed by 1-day pass (23 percent), no fare (free ride service – 17 percent), 31-day pass (13 percent), followed by other lesser used modes.

For trips and out of Scottsdale, 4,100 daily trips are made. Sixty-six percent come from Phoenix, 23 percent from Tempe, 4 percent from Glendale and 7 percent from other cities. Top routes include Route 50 (Camelback) at 17 percent; Route 72 (Scottsdale Road/Rural) at 15 percent, Route 17 (McDowell) at 10 percent; Route 29 (Thomas Road) at 19 percent; Route 170 (Bell) at 8 percent; Route 80 (Northern/Shea) at 7 percent and Route 41 (Indian School) at 5 percent. For numbers of transfers of those coming into Scottsdale, 45 percent had at least one transfer, and 55 percent make no transfer. For purpose of trips, 54 percent are for work, 15 percent are for non-home based, 17 percent are for other destinations, 10 percent for shopping, 3 percent medical, 2 percent school and less than 1 percent college. When asked what mode of transportation people use once in Scottsdale, 90 percent end their trips by walking to a destination and 5 percent cycle.

For trips on Scottsdale trolleys, the survey sample size was 6 percent of total boarding or 170 samples collected. The number of daily trips was 2,200. Eighty-eight percent of riders are Scottsdale residents, 5 percent Phoenix, 4 percent Tempe and 3 percent identify themselves as visitors from the Phoenix Metro area. For percent of trips by route, 43 percent traveled Route 68 CM, 34 percent on Miller/Hayden, 13 percent Mustang and 10 Old Town Trolley. Twenty percent of riders are making at least one transfer, in comparison to 2015, when the total was 14 percent.

Little change is seen in the number of household vehicles from 2015. In 2015, 52 percent of households had zero cars and in 2018, the total decreased to 50 percent. The purpose of trips were 57 percent for work, 21 percent for other destinations, followed by lesser uses. In 2015, there was a wider range of uses noted. With the change in service, the rates are now more typical of what is expected for transit service, with a much higher percentage using public transportation for work purposes. Change in employment status goes hand in hand with the increase in percent of work trips. In 2015, 37 percent of trolley riders were employed full-time, compared to 66 percent in 2019. There is a 26 percent decrease in student riders, typical of what is seen regionally, including K-12 and college students. Change in age is also expected with the decrease in student riders. Ridership is up for ages 25 to 35 and 35 to 44. There was an increase in the percent of riders on trolleys from households earning over \$35,000.

Ms. Koropella addressed next steps, including continual monitoring of the current trolley system. Recently, the Department looked at the vehicle management system data and how operations are progressing. Efficiencies have been identified. Two trolleys were removed for now. Reduced service was justified. If ridership picks up in the future, they can be brought back online. This is the benefit of having access to good data from the installed Clever Devices. VMS is now installed on all buses. There are a few automatic passenger counters (APCs) that need to be upgraded to be compatible with the system. These are pending. The goal is to increase ridership at the right cost. For FY21, the team put a budget package together to market the trolleys. Many residents are still unaware that free trolley service exists. The plan also includes social media outreach and surveys with the goal of improving user experience. The City reports to data to the National Transit database. This year is a mandatory sampling year, which requires a staff member to physically get on the busses and conduct boarding counts for

random trips. This will be helpful in comparing to APC data to ensure that the City's technology is working correctly. There will be an ongoing effort to improve customer experience.

Vice Chair cited the statistic that 80 percent of ridership was not transferring and asked where the riders are going. Mr. Peters stated that most trips were within the City of Scottsdale.

Vice Chair inquired about flex route service. Ms. Koropella explained that flex routes deviate based on demand. There are currently none in Scottsdale, but this may be possible in future.

## **7. OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAM STATUS**

Mr. Worth stated that the Roadway Safety Assessments (RSA) program is used to analyze most accident-prone intersections. The Department looks at the highest accident rate intersections in the City on a recurrent basis and is currently in the midst of this process. Three have been completed and seven are in process. In-house staff is conducting this work. At times, deficiencies are identified to support a capital project. One such project, largely driven by safety improvement needs, is at Hayden and Thomas Road. It began with issues identified through the RSA process. The results of the process were also used to generate support for federal grant funding highway safety improvement program funding.

Approximately a year ago, 124th Street and Shea Boulevard Underpass was begun. This was a trail project with an underpass east of 124th Street. It included rock-filled gabions, which were originally built improperly by the contractor, creating a safety hazard. There is potential litigation between the City and the contractor. The City recently opened bids to remove and rebuild the wall. In response to a question from Chair Graham, Mr. Worth confirmed that it is both a pedestrian and equine underpass. The elevation of the roadway was not changed.

Mr. Worth reviewed progress on the Pinnacle Peak Ranchos Trails Project. The City has spent a couple of years negotiating with property owners for the proper easements to build the necessary connections. They have now successfully negotiated terms for some areas. In another area, the City used existing right-of-way on Ranch Road as well as City-owned property to route a path connecting to the Ashler Hills Trail. There have been a long series of public meetings. As of the last public meeting, there was strong turnout with many engaged citizens who generally expressed satisfaction with the City's proposed solution. Significant funding will be realized with the change in plans from a hardened, compact ADA surface, as this is a rural area horse trail. Horizontal clearance is also not required. They are building more as a preserve trail, with the Preserve trail contractor being used to do the construction at a significant savings. Construction will occur in January.

Biking infrastructure improvements have been completed through the street resurfacing program. Locations include the southeastern portion of McCormick Ranch north of Indian Bend and east of Hayden Road. This will provide better bike lane connections.

Another bike lane project, McDowell Road Bike lanes (included in the CIP), was in question, due to rising construction costs. The City applied for MAG's close-out funding and MAG has recommended the project for approval. The next step is to go to the Management Committee and Regional Council for final approval.

Two staff members will attend an ADA Coordinator Conference on January 16th and 17th in Phoenix. Paratransit staff will participate in the SUSD Transition Fair on February 19th, 2020.

The City was approached by Cocopah Elementary School to see whether staff would be willing to providing mentoring for the Electrobotz 6th Grade First Lego Robotics Team. Staff provided guidance on the project, whereby students were charged with providing a solution to an infrastructure problem. Students used glow in the dark technology to enhance striping on multiuse paths. The students were successful in moving to the next level of the competition at a regional level.

Upcoming Council items for January 14, 2020 include acceptance of grants. This includes a Congestion Mitigation Air Quality (CMAQ) grant for 68th Street and a transportation alternatives grant for Thomas Road. Both are included in the CIP. The City has been selected for award of the grants. The CMAQ grant totals \$615,000 and the project total cost is less than \$900,000. The Transportation grant totals \$3.7 million and the total project cost is \$4.8 million. The grants will help make improvements largely for pedestrians and bicycles.

In terms of staffing, Transportation Director recruitment is tied to the merger between the Street Operations Department and the Transportation Department. Staff is working to combine the groups for efficiencies and coordination. The two departments are now operating as one division. They are working with the HR Department to fill key positions. In addition, Frances Cookson has accepted a job in another department and her position will need to be filled.

In response to a Commissioner question, Mr. Worth stated that recruitment postings are on the City jobsite as well as industry-specific jobsites.

In response to a Commissioner question, Mr. Worth conformed that traffic and collision data is now available. There is a link on the City website. This topic is also on the agenda for the January meeting.

Vice Chair requested a status regarding a possible underpass at McCormick Stillman Railroad Park. Mr. Worth stated that the propose to build the underpass was submitted as part of the CIP. This process and results will be discussed at a later date, most likely in February. The Department submitted approximately \$47 million of new project requests. Revenue projections indicated that there is only \$14 million available. He was unable to recall whether the project is included. He will provide more details at the upcoming discussion. Chair stated that a fix such as additional signage would be helpful, especially as there is an existing underpass. Mr. Worth noted that the other existing underpass is also a stormwater structure.

## **8. PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were no public comments.

## **9. COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

Commissioner requested information regarding possible assistance to business in areas of ongoing construction. Mr. Worth stated that many things are done to assist businesses, however this does not include a fund. He will agendize the issue for future discussion.

Chair asked for an agenda item to address pedestrian amenities and safety in the vicinity of Greenway/Hayden and Scottsdale Road.

**10. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

There were no announcements.

**11. ADJOURNMENT**

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved by Commissioner Anderson and seconded by Commissioner Miller, the meeting adjourned at 7:04 p.m.

AYES: Chair Graham, Vice Chair Iacovo, Commissioners Anderson, Iacovo and Miller.

NAYS: None

SUBMITTED BY:

eScribers, LLC

**\*Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**